

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
1	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 detailing a meeting with Criminal Investigative Division (CID) and Operational Technology Division (OTD) regarding NSO product	1-2	Released in Part (RIP): b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 documenting a meeting between Criminal Investigative Division (CID) and Operational Technology Division (OTD) to discuss potential deployment of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, D, I	A	reprocessed
2	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 documenting a meeting with CID, OTD, and Department of Justice (DOJ) regarding the NSO product	37-38	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 documenting a meeting between CID, OTD, and attorneys from FBI OGC and Department of Justice (DOJ) Criminal Division (CRM) to discuss potential deployment of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, D, I	A	reprocessed
3	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 documenting a meeting with CID, OTD, and DOJ regarding NSO product	39-40	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020 documenting a meeting between CID, OTD, and attorneys DOJ-CRM to discuss potential deployment of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, D, I	A	reprocessed
4	FD-1057 dated March 29, 2021 documenting guidelines from CID regarding NSO product	41-65	WIF: b5-1,-2,-3, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	FD-1057 dated March 29, 2021 documenting conditions of CID and OTD interim approval and recommendation for use of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, C, D, I	B	
5	FD-1057 dated April 5, 2021 from CID documenting a letterhead memorandum (LHM) to the United States Attorney's Office (USAO) and guidelines of NSO product	66	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	FD-1057 dated April 5, 2021 from CID documenting and attaching proposed language for use in Title III applications (Bates 67) and proposed letterhead memorandum (LHM) (Bates 68-76) to be provided to United States Attorney's Offices (USAOs) giving guidelines for proposed use of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, C, D, I	B	
6	LHM and attachment addressed to USAO	67-76	WIF: b5-1,-2,-3, b7E-2,-3	Proposed LHM addressed to USAO (attached to previous record)			B, D, I	added to B	
11	Email from OTD dated July 22, 2021 with SharePoint proposal of NSO product	83-97	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1	Email from OTD dated July 22, 2021 attaching PowerPoint proposal related to NSO product			B, C, D, I	C	
14	Office of Congressional Affairs (OCA) email chain dated December 6, 2021 discussing talking points. Draft talking points attached.	122-124	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	Series of classified emails dated December 6-7, 2021, between and among OCA, OTD, DO, and NSB, discussing and editing draft talking points to be provided to Director in advance of a classified roundtable meeting with the SSCI regarding key member issues. The talking points in these email chains address numerous topics, of which NSO is only one. OCA emailed draft talking points in the initial email on December 6 (122-23), OTD and DO provided comments and proposed edits in track changes (122, 124), NSB provided comments and proposed edits in track changes on December 7 (125-28), which were re-circulated by DO to OCA and OTD (129-31), OTD responded to the NSB version on December 7 (133-35), and OCA circulated the version that was provided to the Director (at 132-33), which differed from the prior version as well as Director's ultimate statements at roundtable meeting.	122-35	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7A-1, b7E-1,-2-3	B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	revised exemptions but no new release
15	OCA email chain dated December 6-7, 2021 discussing talking points. Draft talking points attached.	125-128	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	[see above]			B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
16	OCA and OTD email chain dated December 6-7, 2021 discussing talking points. Draft talking points attached	129-131	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	[see above]			B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
17	OCA and OTD email chain dated December 6-7, 2021 discussing talking points	132-135	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	[see above]		WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7A-1, b7E-1,-2-3	B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	reprocessed
18	OTD email dated December 15, 2021 discussing talking points regarding the NSO product	143-144	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	Classified email dated December 15, 2021, from OTD to DO, providing proposed talking points regarding the NSO product in response to two questions that the Director had previously asked OTD for background purposes, and being provided again in advance of unspecified meeting or call.			B, C, D, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
19	National Security Branch (NSB), OCA, and OTD email chain dated December 6-22, 2021 discussing talking points. Draft talking points attached	155-157	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	December 22, 2021 classified email, between DO and NCB, forwarding earlier December 6-7 email circulating NSB comments on draft talking points (129-31)			B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
20	NSB, OCA, and OTD email chain dated December 6-22, 2021 discussing talking points	158-160	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	December 22, 2021 classified email, within NSB, forwarding earlier December 6-7 email circulating NSB comments on draft talking points (129-31)			B, C, D, F, I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
23	Email chain between OTD, OCA, and OGC dated December 10-14, 2021 discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office. Draft response letter attached	136-142	WIF: b5-1,-2 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	Classified email chain dated 12/10-14/21, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office re clarifying questions from Director's Roundtable with SSCI that week, and attaching draft response with comments and proposed edits in track changes (140-42). Email chain begins with internal OCA email noting that input from OTD needed for one of the questions (138-39), followed by email from OCA asking STB to vet with the appropriate people at OTD (138), email from STB to OTD and OGC (137-38), emails within OTD, copying OGC attorney (136-37) and internal OTD proposed response (136 and 140-42), attaching proposed comments and proposed edits to draft response in track changes. Only one of the three questions/answers in the attachment is responsive to the FOIA request (on page 140; pages 141-42 not responsive). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
24	Email chain between OTD, OCA, and OGC dated December 10-17, 2021 discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office. Draft response letter attached.	145-152	WIF: b5-1,-2 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	Contains emails within 136-42, with additional 12/17/21 email from STB to OTD requesting further edits (145-46) and OTD's responsive email (145) attaching proposed edits to draft response with comments and track changes (150-51; pages 151-52 not responsive). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
25	Email chain between OTD, OCA, and OGC dated December 10, 2021 through January 7, 2022, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office, and attaching internal FBI correspondence and draft response letter	162-171	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-2, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2-3	162-66: Contains emails within 136-42, with additional 12/15/21 emails between OCA and STB (164-66), 1/5/22 follow-up email from OCA to OTD and STB asking specific questions (163), and 1/7/22 internal OTD emails with proposed answers to questions (162-63) and feedback and specific questions from OTD ED (162). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided. 167-71: 1/6/22 classified email to OTD conveying STB request for specific information (167-68) and attaching draft response with comments and track changes (169-71; 170-71 not responsive), and 1/7/22 internal OTD proposed response (167). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
26	Email chain between OTD, OCA, and OGC dated December 10, 2021 through January 10, 2022, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office. Draft response letter attached.	172-176	WIF: b5-1,-2 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2-3	1/6/22 and 1/10/22 classified emails to OGC requesting legal review of draft response to same inquiry from Sen. Wyden's staff (172-73), and 1/10/22 OGC response (173) attaching proposed edits to draft with comments and track changes (174-76; 175-76 not responsive). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
27	Email from OTD dated January 11, 2022, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office. Draft response letter attached.	177-180	WIF: b5-1,-2 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2-3	1/11/22 classified email to OTD (177) circulating OGC's proposed edits to draft response to Sen. Wyden inquiry (178-80; 179-80 not responsive). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
28	Email from OTD dated January 11, 2022, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office. Draft response letter attached.	181, 183-85	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2-3	1/11/22 classified email to OTD AD (181) seeking approval of OTD response to STB inquiry (182) and prior December 2021 OTD response to draft response to Sen. Wyden inquiry containing comments and proposed edits in track changes (183-85; 185 not responsive). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.	181-185		B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
29	Email chain from OTD dated January 11, 2022 discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office and talking points. Draft responses attached.	186-194	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2-3	Contains email and attachments within 181-85, with additional 1/11/22 OTD AD response with comments and questions (186-87), attaching draft talking points (with edits and track changes) from another context as an example (190), and 1/11/22 internal OTD email to staff asking for answers to AD questions (186). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.			B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
31	Email chain between OTD, OCA, and OGC dated December 10, 2021 through February 3, 2022, discussing inquiry from Senator Wyden's Office.	305-307	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1 b7E-1	February 2-3, 2022 classified email chain regarding same inquiry from Sen. Wyden's staff; chain begins with OCA requesting input from EADs for NSB and STB on prior draft response, with comments from OCA (306-07); OCA then adds DO and CTD officials (306); STB responds with comment (305-06), OTD responds with edits and comments (305), and NSB replies with question (305). Written response to inquiry not finalized or provided.		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1 b7E-1, -2, -3	B, C, D, F, I	E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
32	Email chain from OTD dated January 11-12, 2022 discussing NSO information.	284-286	WIF: b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b6/b7C-1 b7E-1	Email chain from OTD dated January 11-12, 2022 providing detailed background on FBI's review of the NSO Group tool.		WIP: b7E-2,-3; WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b6/b7C-1 b7E-1	B, C, D, I	F	
33	Email dated October 21, 2021 from OTD accompanying FBI memorandum to the State of Israel's Defense Export Control Agency. Memorandum dated December 4, 2018	308-309	RIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-3	Email dated October 21, 2021 from OTD accompanying FBI memorandum to the State of Israel's Defense Export Control Agency. Memorandum dated December 4, 2018			A, I	G	
34	Email chain dated August 24, 2018 through October 21, 2021 discussing the approval for the FBI memorandum to the State of Israel's Defense Export Control Agency. Draft letter attached to email chain.	310-318	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3 Draft document RIP: b1-1, b7E-3	Email chain dated August 24, 2018 through October 21, 2021 discussing the approval for the FBI memorandum to the State of Israel's Defense Export Control Agency. Draft letter attached to email chain.			A, I	G	reprocessed
35	Email between OTD and OGC dated July 17-27, 2021 regarding Attorney General William Barr meeting	320-322	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	Email dated July 27, 2021, forwarding email dated July 17, 2019, both among OTD and OGC senders/recipients, regarding Attorney General William Barr meeting in 2019		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2-3	B, C, D, G, I	H	revised exemptions but no new release
36	OTD internal document dated July 15, 2019 detailing a plan for NSO product	324	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3	OTD internal document dated July 15, 2019 detailing resource plan for potential deployment of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, D	I	
37	OTD internal document dated July 15, 2019 detailing a strategy plan for NSO product	326	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3	OTD internal document dated July 15, 2019 detailing strategic plan for potential deployment of NSO product in support of criminal investigations			B, D	I	
42	OTD document describing capabilities of NSO product. Document not dated.	328-329	WIF b5-1, b7E-2,-3	OTD document analyzing multiple potential options for obtaining lawful access to encrypted information in support of criminal investigations, including detailed analysis of capabilities of NSO product. Document not dated.			B, D	J	
43	Internal document provided technical details of an NSO product.	520-525	WIF: b7E-2,-3	Internal document providing technical details of an NSO product. Document not dated.			B; D	J	
44	OTD PowerPoint on the NSO product in support of the FD-1057 dated October 28, 2020	3-36	Withheld in Full (WIF): b5-1, b7E-2,-3 Withheld in Part (WIP): b1-1, b3-1, b7E-5	OTD PowerPoint on the NSO product dated October 28, 2020 (attached to Bates 1-2), including overview of problem the software might solve, comparison to other software, discussion of risks, and next steps.			B, C, D, I	K	
45	OTD PowerPoint with comments regarding NSO product.	372-426	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1,-5	Undated OTD PowerPoint (also containing apparent presenter notes) regarding NSO product, including overview, detailed analysis of specific capabilities and data management, and comparisons to other software.			B, C, D, I	K	
47	OTD PowerPoint with comments regarding NSO Group dated September 4, 2020.	428-461	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-5	OTD PowerPoint dated September 4, 2020 regarding NSO product, including overview of problem the software might solve, comparison to other software, discussion of risks, and next steps.			B, C, D, I	K	
48	OTD and CID PowerPoint regarding NSO Group products.	463-467	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3	Undated OTD and CID PowerPoint overview presentation regarding NSO Group products summarizing the tool's capabilities, risks of proceeding, and making recommendations for next steps.			B; D	K	
49	Emails between OTD and CID, dated January 26-29, 2021, discussing status of acquisition of NSO product	469-471	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Emails between OTD and CID, dated January 26-29, 2021, discussing status of deployment of NSO product, including the views of different components and status of intermediate approvals		WIF: b5-1; WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	B; D; I	L	revised exemptions but no new release
50	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021 and January 31, 2022.	516-518	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021 and January 31, 2022, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
51	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	738-739	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
52	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	740-742	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
59	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	743-744	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
60	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	745-746	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
61	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	747-749	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
62	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	750-752	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
63	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	753-754	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
64	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	755-757	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
65	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	758-760	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
70	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	761-763	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
72	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	764-766	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
73	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	767-769	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
74	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	770-771	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
75	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	772-773	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
76	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	774-776	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
77	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	777-778	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
78	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	779-782	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
79	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-23, 2021.	783-784	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-23, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
80	Email chain regarding the cease on all efforts regarding the potential use of NSO product, dated July 20-22, 2021.	785-786	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-3	Email chain, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions leading up to the July 22, 2021 decision to cease all efforts regarding the potential use of the NSO product, and post-decisional discussion recounting pre-decisional details.			B; D; I	M	
81	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	601	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	Email chain dated October 7, 2021; begins with internal OTD email re upcoming EAD call with AG to discuss other government entity's questions about NSO (613); response from OTD personnel, copying OGC attorney, and setting forth questions and proposed responses (613); OGC attorney's reply with proposed edits (613); response from one OTD personnel (612-13), response from another OTD personnel, with additional question, proposed response, and comment (612); and other OTD personnel weigh in on the comment (612)	601-13	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
82	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	603	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	[see above]		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
83	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	604	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	[see above]		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
84	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	607-609	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	[see above]		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3, b1-1, b3-1	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
85	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	614-616	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	Contains emails within 601-13, with additional 10/7/21 email from OTD personnel describing briefing of EAD regarding upcoming call with AG, and EAD's response (614, 617, 620), to which other OTD personnel respond re follow up tasks and drafting to be done on a classified system (617, 620).	614-25	WIF: b5-1; WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3, b1-1, b3-1	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
86	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	617-619	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	[see above]		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3, b1-1, b3-1	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
87	OTD and OGC email chain dated October 7, 2021 regarding anticipated call with Attorney General	623-625	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	[see above]		WIF: b5-1 WIP: b5-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3, b1-1, b3-1	B; D; G; I	N	revised exemptions but no new release
88	Email chain between OTD, CD, and OGC dated July 20-21, 2021 regarding NSO Group product	704-705	WIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Email chain between OTD, CD, and OGC, dated July 20-21, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions regarding whether the NSO product would be appropriate for potential use in criminal investigations, and the circumstances in which it could be lawfully used for that purpose.		RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; I	O	reprocessed
89	Email chain between CID and OTD dated July 20-22, 2021 regarding NSO Group	735-737	WIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Email chain between CID and OTD, dated July 20-22, 2021, containing pre-decisional discussions regarding whether the NSO product would be appropriate for potential use in criminal investigations, and the circumstances in which it could be lawfully used for that purpose.		RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; I	O	reprocessed
90	Email between OTD and OGC dated July 20, 2021 regarding NSO Group tool	675	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Email between OTD and OGC dated July 20, 2021 regarding status of approval of NSO product		WIF: b5-1; WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	B; D; I	P	revised exemptions but no new release
91	Email chain between OTD and CID dated July 21, 2021 regarding NSO Group tool.	701-703	WIF: b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	Email chain between OTD and CID dated July 21, 2021 regarding NSO Group tool.		WIF: b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7A-1, b7E-1	C; I	P, moved to Q	revised exemptions but no new release
92	Email chain between OTD, CD, and OGC dated July 20-21, 2021 and January 31, 2022 regarding NSO Group products	787-788	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Email chain between OTD, CD, and OGC dated July 20, 2021 and January 31, 2022 regarding NSO Group products			B; D; I	P	
93	FBI internal document describing and presenting deliberations about potential use of NSO tool in criminal investigations, dated May 11, 2021	499-501	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b7A-1	FBI internal document prepared by CID and OTD providing background on the NSO tool and establishment of guidelines for potential use of NSO tool in criminal investigations, dated May 11, 2021			B; D; H	Q	
94	Briefing document regarding potential deployment of NSO tool in support of criminal investigations, for Director's Daily Brief, dated May 11, 2021.	503-510	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b5-3, b6/b7C-1, b7E-5	Briefing document created by CID for Director's Daily Brief, regarding assessment and evaluation of NSO tool for potential use of NSO tool in criminal investigations, dated May 11, 2021			B; C; D; I	Q	
95	Feedback provided by Deputy Director Abbate regarding May 11, 2021 Director's Daily Brief	512-514	WIF: b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-5	Feedback provided by Deputy Director Abbate regarding May 11, 2021 Director's Daily Brief pertaining to the status and process for potential use of the NSO tool			B; D; I	Q	
97	Standard Form 1449 (SF 1449) dated September 28, 2018	816-822	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1				A; I		*Challenge to 1 and 3 (contract documents)
98	SF 1449 dated September 30, 2019	817-828	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1		823-828		A; I		*Challenge to 1 and 3 (contract documents)
99	Contract document dated August 31, 2020	829-840	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-3				A; I		*Challenge to 1 and 3 (contract documents)
100	SF 1449 dated September 2, 2020	841-847	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1				A; I		*Challenge to 1 and 3 (contract documents)
<u>Responsive Documents Identified in Supplemental Searches</u>									
101	December 7, 2021 classified email Chain attaching final Memorandum from OCA to Director containing talking points for classified SSCI roundtable, including NSO-related talking points, which differ from Director's ultimate statement to SSCI	848-850	RIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E -1, -2, -3				B, C, D, F, I	added to D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
102	December 7, 2021 classified email Chain attaching NSB EAD's proposed edits to draft Memorandum from OCA to Director containing talking points for classified SSCI roundtable, including NSO-related talking points. Proposed edits are to talking points on a different (non-NSO) topic. NSO-related talking points in this draft differ from final version provided to Director and Director's ultimate statements to SSCI	854-856	WIF: b5-1; WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/b7C-1, b7A-1, b7E -1, -2, -3				B, C, D, F, I	added to D (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
103	Q&A on NSO topic at SSCI Roundtable on December 7, 2021	851-852	RIF: with exception of material out of scope					added to D	

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
104	Email chain dated February 2-5, 2022, in which OCA solicits feedback from EADs for NSB and STB on OTD's draft response to inquiry from Sen. Wyden; officials from DO and CTD are added to chain; STB EAD responds with a comment; OTD ED provides additional comments and proposed edits; NCB EAD asks a question, to which CTD official responds, attaching two documents, one of which is NCB's earlier comments on draft response, and the other of which is non-responsive.	857-859	WIF: b-1; WIP: b1-1, b3-1, b6/7C-1, b7E -2, -3				B, C, D, F, I	added to E (also 1 and 3/talking points)	
105	Emails from OTD AD to dated December 4, 2021, commenting on specific aspects of media report	853	WIF: b7A-1; WIP: b6/7C-1, b7E -1, -2, -3					added to Q (misc)	
106-108	Classified (TS) emails dated September 24-October 13, 2021, between and among another Executive Branch component and DOJ/ODAG and FBI (including OTD, CTD, and DO), in which the Executive Branch component asks certain questions and follow-up questions of DOJ/ODAG, FBI circulates draft response internally and then provides proposed response to ODAG, ODAG asks a follow-up question, and FBI responds to that question.	860-884	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3, b1-1, b3-1				B; D; G; I	added to N	
<u>NO LONGER AT ISSUE</u>									
7	Email from OTD dated April 9, 2019 discussing the potential acquisition of NSO product	77	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
8	Email from OTD dated April 9, 2019 discussing the potential acquisition of NSO product with lync meeting invite	78	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
9	Email from OTD dated June 27-28, 2019 discussing the potential purchase of NSO product	79-80	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
10	Email chain between OTD and Counterintelligence Division (CD) dated June 16-18, 2020 discussing the potential purchase of NSO product	81-82	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b7A-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, H, I		not at issue
12	Email chain from OTD dated July 22, 2021 discussing the NSO Group products	115-117	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
13	Email chain with OTD and Office of General Counsel (OGC) discussing a DOJ inquiry, dated September 20-21, 2021	118-121	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1-2,-3, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, G, I		not at issue
21	Email chain between OCA and OTD dated December 20, 2021 discussing talking points	153-154	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1				B, D, I		not at issue
22	Email between OTD and OGC dated January 20, 2022, discussing response to a news media report and draft talking points.	526	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1	January 20, 2022 cover email from OTD to OGC attorney (526) forwarding OTD email and attached draft talking points in response to NYT questions to DOJ and FBI; the draft talking points (527-28) are a duplicate of 648-49 (within document 647-49), and contain comments and edits in track changes.			E; I	D (also 1 and 3/talking points) BUT does not belong in Group D; this is a cover email attaching a document (647-49) that NYT no longer challenges	not at issue
30	Email from OTD dated January 26, 2022 and draft compendium regarding NSO	287-297	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
38	Emails between OTD and OGC dated December 11, 2019 through April 30, 2020 discussing NSO and potential use of NSO product.	331-339	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b5-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b5-2, b7A-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, H, I		not at issue

Document number	Original Description	Bates	Exemptions/Coded Categories	Revised description	Revised Bates	Revised Exemptions	Document Category (citation to subparagraph of 37 in Seidel Decl.)	NYT Group	Additional note
39	Emails between OTD, OGC, and Cyber Division (CyD) dated March 6, 2020 through May 14, 2020 discussing NSO Group.	341-346	WIF: b1-1, b3-1 WIP: b5-1, b7A-1, b6/b7C-1,-3, b7E-1,-2,-3				B, C, D, H, I		not at issue
40	Emails between OTD and CyD dated June 5-8, 2020 discussing NSO.	363-366	WIF: b1-1, b3-1, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B, C, D, I		not at issue
41	Emails between OTD and CD dated June 16-22, 2020 discussing NSO.	368-370	WIF: b1-1, b3-1 WIP: b5-1, b7A-1, b6/b7C-1,-2, b7E-1,-2,-3				B, C, D, H, I		not at issue
46	Undated draft DOJ memorandum regarding potential use of NSO tool in criminal investigations	473-485	WIF: b5-1,-2, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7A-1				B; D; H; I		not at issue
53	Email chain between FBI and DOJ dated January 20, 2022 discussing response to a news media report and draft talking points. Draft document attached.	532-538	Email RIP: b5-1,-2, b6/b7C-1,-2, b7E-2,-3 Document WIF: b5-1,-2, b7E-2,-3				B; D; E; I		not at issue
54	Email chain between OTD and OGC coordinating a response to news media inquiry, dated January 26, 2022	541-543	RIP: b5-1, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				E; I		not at issue
55	Email between OTD, OGC, and OPA coordinating a response to news media inquiry, dated January 27, 2022	547-548	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1,-2, b7E-1				E; I		not at issue
56	Email chain between OTD and OGC discussing press reports regarding NSO group, dated September 9, 2020, and attachment of public court filing	549-590	RIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1				B; I		not at issue
57	Email chain between OTD and OGC discussing press reports re NSO group, dated September 9, 2020, and attachment of public court filing	593-95	RIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3				B; D; I		not at issue
58	OGC email chain dated July 18, 2021 regarding NSO	599	RIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2				B; I		not at issue
66	OGC and OTD email chain dated November 3, 2021 responding to new article about NSO Group	636-640	RIP: b5-1,-2, b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3				B; C; I		not at issue
67	Email chain between FBI and DOJ dated January 20, 2022 discussing response to a news media report and draft talking points.	644	RIP: b5-1,-2, b6/b7C-1,-2, b7E-2,-3				E; I		not at issue
68	Email chain between FBI and DOJ dated January 20, 2022 discussing response to a news media report and draft talking points.	647-649	Email RIP: b5-1,-2, b6/b7C-1,-2, b7E-2,-3 Document WIF: b5-1,-2, b7E-2,-3				E; I		not at issue
69	Email among DOJ and FBI dated December 20, 2021-January 20, 2022, discussing potential responses to press inquiries	650-660	RIP: b5-1, b7A-1, b6/b7C-1,-2,-3, b7E-1,-2,-3				E; H; I		not at issue
71	Draft DOJ memorandum regarding potential use of NSO Group tool in criminal investigations with handwritten annotations	662-674	WIF: b5-1,-2, b7E-2,-3 WIP: b6/b7C-1,-2, b7A-1				B; D; G; H; I		not at issue
96	Email dated June 24, 2021 between OGC and CD regarding NSO Group tool and draft DOJ memorandum	661	WIF: b5-1 WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1,-2,-3	Cover email transmitting draft DOJ memo (662-74) that NYT is not challenging.		WIP: b6/b7C-1, b7E-1, -2, -3	B; D; I	Q	not at issue